



Office of the City Manager
City Hall/100 Central Avenue
Garden City, Georgia 31405

Scott C. Robider
Deputy City Manager

MEMORANDUM

To: Mayor and City Council
From: Scott Robider – Deputy City Manager
Date: September 27, 2021
Re: Contractor Debris Removal, Reduction, and Disposal Services

The purpose of this memo is to provide a summary of the City Staff's review and evaluation of the Request for Proposal (RFP) Packages that were submitted to the City on August 19, 2021 and to provide a recommendation of award for the referenced solicitation. The City Staff undertook this procurement due to the expiration of the agreement with our previous contractor (Crowder Gulf) on December 31, 2021 with no additional extensions allowed.* This RFP action will ensure that the City has a contractor(s) in place for future incident debris operations such as a hurricane type events.

An RFP was developed with a timeline to review and respond in time to make the award prior to the existing contract expiring. The RFP package was disseminated via email to experienced firms known by the City. In addition, the RFP was posted for public review on the Garden City website on July 12, 2021 under the "For Business/Bids & Proposals" category as well as being posted on the Georgia Local Government Access (GLGA) and the Georgia Procurement Registry (GPR) on July 12, 2021.

The RFP stated that the City encouraged the participation of small business enterprises and/or minority business enterprises. The City received questions from prospective proposers during the process which were addressed jointly by *Rostan Solutions* and the City Staff. The following firms made inquiries and submitted RFP packages:

- DRC Emergency Services, LLC
- Southern Disaster Recovery
- Crowder Gulf
- TFR Enterprises Inc.
- Custom Tree Care Inc.
- Ceres Environmental Services, Inc.
- D&J Enterprises, Inc.
- Graham County Land Company
- KDF, Inc.

* Said agreement having an initial term running from June 5, 2017 through December 31, 2019 and then being renewed for an additional two (2) year term in accordance with the contract provisions.

The City received nine (9) proposals by the deadline stated in the RFP. In anticipation of the submittals, the City formulated an evaluation committee to conduct a review of the proposals and provide a recommendation.

Pursuant to the requirements of the RFP, the City was seeking to engage a debris management contractor(s) that could offer the City the highest quality, greatest benefit and best value to the City related to "Incident Debris Removal, Reduction and Disposal Services". As part of the RFP, the City sought information and details from prospective contractors regarding the following information/criteria:

- Compliance with the Mandatory RFP Requirements: These requirements as stipulated in the RFP are evaluated as a pass/fail outcome. All mandatory requirements were met = **PASS (P)**, and any mandatory requirement that was not met = **FAIL (F)**. If a submittal is evaluated as **FAIL**, meaning that one or more of the mandatory requirements were not met, it is deemed "non-responsive" and was not formally scored.
- Qualifications Evaluation: Subjective scoring by committee
- Ability Evaluation: Subjective scoring by committee
- Technical Evaluation: Subjective scoring by committee
- Price Evaluation: Cost analysis scored as best value

The RFP stated that the City would review and evaluate the proposals using the following scale:

Compliance with Request for Proposal (Mandatory)	Pass/Fail
Qualifications Evaluation	30
Ability Evaluation	25
Technical Evaluation	25
Price Evaluation	20
TOTAL	100

In accordance with the RFP criteria and as generally summarized herein, a committee of City staff consisting of the persons listed below performed a review and evaluation of the nine (9) proposals that were submitted. The committee consisted of the following:

- Scott Robider, Deputy City Manager
- Katie Draeger, Assistant Finance Director

A table summarizing the reviews of the three (3) passing submittals is shown below.

	Crowder Gulf	CERES	DRC
COMPLIANCE WITH REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL (MANDATORY)	PASS	PASS	PASS
QUALIFICATIONS EVALUATION	29/ 30 Points	27/ 30 Points	25/ 30 Points
ABILITY EVALUATION	25/ 25 Points	23/ 25 Points	22/ 25 Points
TECHNICAL EVALUATION	24/ 25 Points	22/ 25 Points	21/ 25 Points
PRICE EVALUATION	20/ 20 Points	18/ 20 Points	14/ 20 Points
SUMMARY	97/ 100	91/ 100	86/ 100

The following six (6) firms were evaluated for compliance with the mandatory evaluation criteria outlined in the RFP and were found to be noncompliant and received a score of **FAIL**:

- Southern Disaster Recovery
- TFR Enterprises Inc.
- Custom Tree Care Inc.
- D&J Enterprises, Inc.
- Graham County Land Company
- KDF, Inc.

It should be noted that Crowder Gulf was the City's previous contractor for this type of work and satisfactorily performed their work following several hurricane events. Furthermore, Crowder Gulf has been assisting other municipalities in Chatham County which should provide a benefit in future resource deployment and event operations. Finally, Crowder Gulf's cost proposal information was deemed to be the most cost effective as compared to the other submittals evaluated.

Based on the staff's review of the three (3) passing submittals, the City has ranked the contractors as follows:

- 1. Crowder Gulf (Primary)**
- 2. CERES (Secondary)**
- 3. DRC (Secondary)**

Based on these results, a proposed contract / agreement will be offered to these three contractors, for a period commencing on January 1, 2022 and continuing through December 31, 2024, with an option by the City to renew for one (1) additional two (2) year period. As noted, Crowder Gulf will be considered the primary contractor for Debris Removal, Reduction, and Disposal Services. CERES and DRC will be considered secondary contractors, activated if Garden City deems it in the City's best interest for future post-incident debris management operations.

Please contact me with questions or concerns regarding this Memorandum.